

PUBLIC SAFETY APPRENTICESHIP WORKGROUP Interim Report 2022

MEICAL

OFICER



December 1, 2022

The Honorable Guy Guzzone Chairman, Senate Budget and Taxation Committee 3 W Miller Senate Office Building Annapolis, MD 21401

The Honorable Maggie McIntosh Chairman, House Appropriations Committee House Office Building, Room 121 Annapolis, MD 21401-1991

RE: Interim Report on Apprenticeships in Public Safety Workgroup - 2022 JCR

Dear Chairmen Guzzone and McIntosh:

In accordance with Pages 153-155 of the 2022 Joint Chairmen's Report, the Maryland Department of Labor is pleased to present this interim report on the Department's efforts to convene a workgroup to explore apprenticeships in public safety. In conducting this workgroup, the Department is pleased to have collaborated with the Maryland Department of Public Safety and Correctional Services, Maryland State Police, and multiple County and local agencies.

This interim report offers preliminary assessments on Maryland's public safety workforce and considerable discussion of Registered Apprenticeship programs. The workgroup will continue to meet in the coming year and will submit a final report of its activities by June 30, 2023. I look forward to your review of this interim report and will be pleased to respond to any questions.

Sincerely,

Till P. John

Tiffany P. Robinson Secretary

Enclosure cc: Members, Senate Budget and Taxation Committee Members, House Appropriations Committee Secretary Robert Green, Maryland Department of Public Safety and Correctional Services Colonel Woodrow Jones III, Maryland Department of State Police Emily Haskel, Department of Legislative Services

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Transmittal Letter	2
TABLE OF CONTENTS	3
SECTION I: INTERIM WORKGROUP REPORT – BACKGROUND	4
SECTION II: WORKGROUP PARTICIPANTS	5
SECTION III: BACKGROUND, DEFINITIONS, & INFORMATION FOR APPRENTICESHIP	8
SECTION IV: OCCUPATION PROFILES	11
SUBSECTION A: CORRECTIONAL OFFICERS	11
Staffing Levels & Vacancy	11
Figure 1 - Average Vacancy, Turnover, and Staff Near-Retirement Rates	
for Maryland County Correctional Institutions, Select Occupations (2022)	12
Current Training, Certification, or Recruitment Processes	13
SUBSECTION B: POLICE OFFICERS	14
Staffing Levels & Vacancy	14
Figure 2 - Average Vacancy Rates for MDOT Police Officer Classifications	15
(January - October 2022)	15
Figure 3 - FY23 Vacancy Statistics for Baltimore City Police Department	16
Current Training, Certification, or Recruitment Processes	16
SUBSECTION C: COMMUNITY SUPERVISION	18
Staffing Levels & Vacancy	18
Current Training, Certification, or Recruitment Processes	18
SECTION V: APPRENTICESHIP IN	19
PUBLIC SAFETY – CASE STUDIES	19
CASE STUDY A: BALTIMORE COUNTY POLICE DEPARTMENT - OFFICER APPRENTICESHIP	19
Figure 4 - Total Registrations and Demographic Data for Baltimore County Police Registered Apprenticeship Program (1987-2022)	20
CASE STUDY B: STATE OF CALIFORNIA CORRECTIONAL PEACE OFFICER APPRENTICESHIP	21
CASE STUDY C: CONSTABLE DEGREE-APPRENTICESHIP IN THE UNITED KINGDOM	22

SECTION VI: POTENTIAL MODELS FOR PUBLIC SAFETY	
APPRENTICESHIP IN MARYLAND	25
MODEL A: EXPAND EMPLOYER SPONSORED REGISTERED APPRENTICESHIP	25
MODEL B: CREATE LOCAL OR REGIONAL JOINT	
APPRENTICESHIP & TRAINING COMMITTEES	26
MODEL C: ESTABLISH A STATEWIDE APPRENTICESHIP COMMISSION	27
Figure 5 - Example of a Statewide Commission Structure	
Under MPCTC and DPSCS	28
SECTION VII: WORKGROUP OUTLOOK	28
Figure 6 - Officer Apprentice Retention Review: Baltimore County Police	
Department Registered Apprenticeship Program Completers (1987 - 2022)	30
Figure 7 - Comparison of Models for Public Safety Apprenticeship	
in Maryland from Section VI	31

SECTION I: INTERIM WORKGROUP REPORT – BACKGROUND

During the 2022 session of the Maryland General Assembly, the Chairmen of the Senate Budget and Taxation Committee and House Appropriations Committee authored the <u>Report on the Fiscal</u> 2023 State Operating Budget (SB 290) and the State Capital Budget (SB 291) and Related <u>Recommendations</u>. The committee narrative on "Apprenticeship Workgroups for Targeted Occupations," outlined the Committees' concern with workforce shortages among government employees in the public safety, health, and transportation sectors. The narrative directed the Maryland Department of Labor to convene workgroups to study and report on the short-term and long-term needs in each respective sector, as well as efforts to:

• identify the extent of vacancies at the State and local level within each sector, specifically including, but not limited to, police officers, correctional officers, parole and probation agents, direct care and public health workers, bus operators, and vehicle maintenance personnel;

• review existing apprenticeships in the United States and elsewhere specifically for occupations in these identified sectors;

• design apprenticeships in the occupations within the identified sectors that have the greatest recruitment challenges and training deficiencies, including estimated costs and potential funding opportunities;

• identify opportunities to start apprenticeships at the high school level consistent with the Blueprint for Maryland's Future;

• identify opportunities, in coordination with the University System of Maryland (USM), the Maryland Association of Community Colleges (MACC), University of Maryland Global Campus (UMGC), the Maryland Career and Technical Education (CTE) Committee, and the Maryland State Department of Education (MSDE), to create degree apprenticeship programs and other ways to incorporate associate and bachelor's degrees in apprenticeships; and

• identify potential apprenticeship sponsors in each occupation.

By request of the Chairmen, the Maryland Department of Labor has authored this interim report on efforts to convene the requested workgroup on public safety. The subsequent sections provide data and information gathered through workgroup sessions, present models and existing programs for public safety apprenticeship, and share opportunities and challenges facing apprenticeship as a tool of workforce development for government public safety employees.

SECTION II: WORKGROUP PARTICIPANTS

Beginning in June 2022, MD Labor's Division of Workforce Development and Adult Learning (DWDAL) issued letters to all department-level state agencies identified by the Chairmen requesting that they assign staff designees to serve on a workgroup to study apprenticeship in public safety. DWDAL additionally consulted the Department of Budget Management's (DBM) list of exclusive bargaining representatives and their respective bargaining units and issued letters to any bargaining representatives that were listed for state occupations that were presumed to be covered by the workgroup's sessions.

Additional workgroup participants were identified from community organizations, trade groups, education institutions, workforce development system constituents, and legislative representatives. The following roster details agencies and representatives who attended at least one public safety workgroup session in 2022.

Maryland Department of Labor

Office of the Secretary	Andrew Fulginiti, Director of Legislative Affairs Mike Preisinger, Legislative/Policy Assistant Will Grant, Policy Officer
Division of Workforce Development & Adult Learning	Assistant Secretary James Rzepowski Deputy Assistant Secretary Erin Roth
	Logan Dean, Policy Analyst
Apprenticeship & Training Program	Christopher MacLarion, Director

	Jeffrey Smith, Program Manager Faith Ramsburg, Apprenticeship Navigator Ginamarie Best, Program Manager Jane Sinclair, Apprenticeship Navigator
	Jennifer Runkles, Apprenticeship Navigator
Governor's Workforce Development Board	Michael DiGiacomo, Executive Director Kenneth Lemberg, Deputy Director Molly Mesnard, Workforce Engagement Director

Maryland Department of Public Safety & Correctional Services

Police & Correctional Training Commissions	Albert Liebno, Executive Director
Division of Parole & Probation	Martha Danner, Director
Human Resources Services Division	Tara Nelson, Deputy Director
Maryland Police Training & Standards Commission	Wayne Silver, Executive Director

Maryland Department of State Police

Aviation Command	Mjr. Michael Tagliaferri, Assistant Bureau Chief
Personnel Command	Mjr. Rosemary Chappell, Commander
Strategic Planning Command	Lt. Michael Brady, Legislative Liaison

County & Local Public Safety Agencies

Anne Arundle County Department of Corrections	Christopher Klein, Superintendent
Baltimore Police Department	Mjr. Derek Loeffler, Commander, Education & Training Section
Howard County Department of Corrections	Margaret Chippendale, Deputy Director
St. Mary's County Detention & Rehabilitation Center	Mary Ann Thompson, Warden
Wicomico County	Ruth Colbourne, Warden

Department of Corrections

Education & Workforce Agencies

Baltimore County Department of Economic & Workforce Development	Lauren Coleman, Talent Management Coordinator
Employ Prince George's, Inc.	Rebecca Webster, Director, Strategic Planning
University of Baltimore, School of Criminal Justice	Dr. Debra Stanley, Executive Director, Professor
Wicomico County Public Schools	Babe Wilson, Captain of Field Operations

Labor and Trade Organizations

American Federation of State,	Denise Gilmore, Legislative Director
County, and Municipal Employees	Sgt. Oluwadamilola Olaniyan, President
Council 3	AFSCME Local 1678
Maryland Correctional Administrators Association	Mary Ann Thompson, President

Legislative Participants

Maryland District 21	Senator James Rosapepe Owen Khan, Chief of Staff
Office of the Senate President	Jody Sprinkle, Deputy Chief of Staff Damian Lang, Public Policy Fellow

Session Schedule & Attendance Record

	Date	Time	Session Location	Attended / Invited
Session 1	08/01/2022	1 PM - 2:30 PM	Virtual	26 / 33
Session 2	09/06/2022	1 PM - 2:30 PM	Virtual	25 / 33
Session 3	10/03/2022	1 PM - 2:30 PM	Virtual	25 / 33
Session 4	11/07/2022	1 PM - 2:30 PM	Public Safety Education and Training Center	26 / 33

SECTION III: BACKGROUND, DEFINITIONS, & INFORMATION FOR APPRENTICESHIP

Background on Apprenticeship & The Registered Apprenticeship Program

Apprenticeship is a centuries old practice of employee training that has been widely practiced in countries around the world, primarily in the skilled trades. Registered Apprenticeship pairs trainees (apprentices) with skilled tradespeople (journeyworkers) and utilizes mentorship and on-the-job learning to confer occupation specific skills that become more complex over the course of training. Unlike other forms of training, apprentices are considered full time, W-2 employees from the outset and are paid for their work and for progressive skill gains throughout their apprenticeship.

In the United States, apprenticeship was formalized by the National Apprenticeship Act (NAA) of 1937, also known as the Fitzgerald Act. The NAA established the basis for America's modern leading model for apprenticeship, the Registered Apprenticeship Program. The Act also gave the US Department of Labor (USDOL) the authority to issue regulation protecting the health, safety, and general welfare of apprentices (29 CFR Part 29) as well as preventing racial, ethnic, religious, age, disability and gender discrimination in apprenticeship programs (29 CFR Part 30). In the 2021 fiscal year, the US Department of Labor reported 593,690 active Registered Apprentices across the United States.

Registered Apprenticeship is a structured approach to apprenticeship that requires sponsor organizations or employers to develop program standards and register with either USDOL or an authorized State Apprenticeship Agency. The process of registration provides opportunities for technical assistance, validation, and oversight which ensures that all apprentices receive a consistent and comprehensive standard of training and related instruction, and secures the health and safety of all apprentices. In the state of Maryland, the Maryland Department of Labor (MD Labor) is the State Apprenticeship Agency which has been authorized by USDOL since 1962 to register and oversee Registered Apprenticeship Programs.

Within MD Labor, Registered Apprenticeship is administered by the Maryland Apprenticeship and Training Program (MATP), an office of the Division of Workforce Development and Adult Learning (DWDAL). MATP provides technical assistance to sponsors seeking to register an apprenticeship program in Maryland. Once a sponsor has created apprenticeship standards and an organized program curriculum that meets Maryland's requirements, it goes before the Maryland Apprenticeship and Training Council (MATC) for approval. MATC approved programs are registered with the State. The employer or sponsor is also responsible for registering their apprentices with MATP.

As of September 2022, there were more than 12,000 apprentices registered in Maryland, across 182 active Registered Apprenticeship programs, encompassing 3,879 employers.

Key Definitions & Components for Registered Apprenticeship in Maryland

In order to register an apprenticeship program in Maryland, sponsors must typically present the Maryland Apprenticeship and Training Council with apprenticeship standards and a curriculum that include at least the following key components:

National Occupational Credential	Every graduate of a Registered Apprenticeship program must receive a nationally recognized credential referred to as a certificate of completion. The portable credential signifies that the apprentice is fully qualified to perform the essential functions of the occupation.
On the Job Learning (OJL)	A foundational component of Registered Apprenticeship, OJL refers to the hands-on training an apprentice receives while engaging in the functions of the registered occupation during paid employment. OJL is supervised and led on a 1:1 basis by an experienced mentor referred to as a journeyworker. Apprenticeship standards submitted by a sponsor will specify which skills an apprentice learns on the job and whether the skills are validated by accrued work hours, demonstration of competency, or both. Programs registered in Maryland generally must include at least 2,000 of OJL for each year of the apprenticeship.
Registered Apprenticeship Sponsor	An entity, business, committee, or organization that manages a Registered Apprenticeship program that has been approved by the Maryland Apprenticeship and Training Council (MATC). Employers can serve as sponsors, but sponsors may also be committees of employers and labor unions, community organizations, colleges and universities, local workforce boards, or other entities that earn approval from MATC.
Related Instruction (RI)	Another required component of Registered Apprenticeship, RI refers to the more formalized classroom-style instruction that is offered in conjunction with OJT. Related instruction is often provided by a community college, trade school, labor union, virtual learning platform, correspondence school, or third party, but can also be provided in-house by the employer. Programs registered in Maryland must include at least 144 hours of related instruction for each year of the apprenticeship.
Rewards for Skill Gains	As apprentices gain experience and progress through their training schedule they must earn progressive wage increases. Progressive wage increases and the skill gains associated are outlined in the standards for a proposed Registered Apprenticeship.

Youth Apprenticeship in Maryland

In 2015, the Maryland Youth Apprenticeship Advisory Committee (YAAC) authored its first report on Youth Apprenticeship in Maryland and set into motion plans for a statewide system for implementing Youth Apprenticeship as a means of training and developing the State's young workers. While Registered Apprenticeship programs typically require that apprentices be at least

18 years of age and in possession of a high school diploma or its equivalent, or able to earn one during the course of the apprenticeship, Youth Apprenticeship establishes standards that can be embedded in secondary education, reaching apprentices as young as 16 or 17 years of age with parent or guardian consent.

After a successful pilot program, the Apprenticeship Maryland Program (AMP) was launched as a statewide program in 2018 to administer Youth Apprenticeship through joint oversight by MD Labor and the Maryland State Department of Education (MSDE). Youth Apprentices involved in AMP work a minimum of 450 hours with a certified employer while receiving Related Instruction through their school district, a community college, or other trade school. The program allows apprentices to make progress toward their diploma while also earning a wage and developing industry-recognized vocational skills. As of November 2022, 22 of Maryland's 24 school districts participated in AMP, enrolling 423 students across 368 employers.

While AMP has posted year-over-year gains in apprentice participation and business and school district engagement since its inception, the program is expected to expand rapidly to meet the State's goals for career and technical education. The Blueprint for Maryland's Future sets a goal for 45 percent of high school graduates completing apprenticeships or industry-recognized occupational credentialing by the 2030-2031 school year. Based on 2021-22 school year enrollments, around 25,800 high school graduates will need to be engaged in apprenticeship or other CTE programming by 2030-2031 to meet the Blueprint's goal. Currently only about 7 percent of Maryland high school graduates meet the Blueprint's CTE criteria.

Potential Strengths of Registered Apprenticeship & Youth Apprenticeship

Despite its long history, Registered Apprenticeship in the United States has a fairly limited body of comprehensive longitudinal research. The USDOL Office of Apprenticeship and many State Apprenticeship Agencies, including MD Labor, are working to expand and improve data systems to better study the potential benefits of apprenticeship. Existing data, primarily from the building trades and skilled crafts indicate strong lifetime wage outcomes for apprentices and improved retention and training outcomes for employers.

A November 2021 report by the Maryland Longitudinal Data System Center¹ (MLDS) examined five-year outcomes from apprentices that completed the MATP in 2012-2013. The analysis found that the cohort reported median quarterly wages of \$20,725, equating to a median annual salary of \$82,900. Findings from this cohort demonstrate that apprenticeship completers, while a minority of the workforce, earn median quarterly wages that are nearly double those of associate's degree holders.

Case studies published by the USDOL Office of Apprenticeship² on long term federally Registered Apprenticeships indicate that apprenticeship completers see a \$300,000 lifetime earning advantage over peers not involved in apprenticeship, and that apprentice employers retain as many as 93 percent of their apprentice employees after training. Case data for a

¹ Exploring Workforce Outcomes Of Maryland Apprenticeship And Training Program Completers. (2021). Maryland Longitudinal Data System Center.

² USDOL OA Apprenticeship Case Studies. (2022). USDOL.

Maryland Registered Apprenticeship program in public safety is included in Section V of this report. This case presents potential retention benefits for law enforcement agencies that deploy Registered Apprenticeship.

SECTION IV: OCCUPATION PROFILES

The Chairmen requested the Workgroup on Apprenticeship in Public Safety study and report vacancy and other occupational information for target occupations in Maryland's public sector public safety system, specifically, police, correctional officers, and parole and probation agents. This section comprehensively profiles each occupation and offers reports on information that was made available to the Workgroup.

Maryland's public safety system includes State-level agencies and numerous county and local-level agencies. While agencies like the Maryland Police and Correctional Training Commissions (MPCTC) exist to standardize and oversee some aspects of the public safety system, law enforcement below the State-level is largely decentralized and systems and policies can vary from county to county and from municipality to municipality. The following subsections delineate information when there are differences between State of Maryland agencies and county/local agencies. As a result of this overall decentralization, vacancy and occupational statistics presented in this section may not be reported uniformly. Notes are provided to identify where reporting periods and methodology vary.

SUBSECTION A: CORRECTIONAL OFFICERS

Staffing Levels & Vacancy

Information for Maryland State Correctional Agencies

The Maryland Department of Public Safety and Correctional Services (DPSCS) is the State of Maryland's sole agency for institutional corrections. DPSCS operates 13 correctional facilities and 5 detention facilities throughout the State of Maryland, housing a daily average population of around 18,300 inmates. Data provided in the Department's 2023 FY Operating Budget Analysis³ report that the Division of Corrections (DOC), Patuxent Institution (PATX), and Maryland Correction Enterprises (MCE) - the functional units of DPSCS where most correctional officers (CO) are employed — are allowed 5,071 total regular staff positions in fiscal year 2023. The majority of these regular positions (~3,700) are correctional officers.

The FY2023 DPSCS Budget Analysis found that DPSCS saw net losses in correctional officer staff annually since 2015, precipitating a cumulative hiring gap that created understaffed conditions, excessive use of overtime, and other persistent staffing challenges. Since 2020,

³ Analysis of the FY 2023 Maryland Executive Budget - Q00B Corrections Department of Public Safety and Correctional Services. (2022). Department of Legislative Services, Office of Policy Analysis.

DPSCS has taken considerable steps to improve CO training and hiring, and the initiatives resulted in net positive hiring gains among COs for 2020, 2021, and the first quarter of 2022.

According to findings in the FY2023 Budget Analysis, COs accounted for the largest number of DPSCS' total correctional staff vacancies (245) but the lowest percentage of vacancy for all classes (6.5%). Psychologists, counselors, and social workers reported the highest vacancy rate among all classifications (42%) and the median vacancy rate for all correctional staff classifications within DPSCS was around 22 percent.

In DPSCS' July 2022 Hiring and Attrition Report, figures for Quarter 1 of calendar year 2022 (CY22) indicate continued improvement in hiring and retaining correctional staff. Q1 averaged 46 correctional hires and 34 correctional separations per month, for a net gain of 12 correctional staff per month. Q2 saw this trend reverse with an average of 21 hires and 47 separations, a net loss of around 26 correctional staff per month. DPSCS notes that the end of the fiscal year is a historic high period for staff separations. For CY22, resignations represent a slight majority of all separations (41.1%) with the next largest shares going to retirement (40.4%) and terminations (8.4%).

Information for County and Local Correctional Agencies

Every county in Maryland, with the exception of Baltimore City, administers its own independent correctional facility or system of correctional facilities. Facilities range in size from around 100 beds to near 1,000, employing anywhere from a dozen to hundreds of correctional officers. In the majority of counties, the correctional facility is a division of the county sheriff's office, while others operate stand alone departments of corrections.

Absent comprehensive budget and payroll analysis like those provided for DPSCS, correctional officer staffing and vacancy data for the county level was gathered directly by MD Labor through a survey of county correctional administrators from across the state. Fourteen counties responded to the survey and the findings are reported in Figure 1. Data provided are based on budgeted positions for FY23 and personnel data as of September 2022.

Figure 1 - Average Vacancy, Turnover, and Staff Near-Retirement Rates for Maryland County Correctional Institutions, Select Occupations (2022)

Occupation	Average Vacancy Rate	Average Turnover Rate	% of staff within 5 years of retirement	
Correctional Officers	14.5%	13.2%	11.8%	
Psychologists, social workers, and counselors	24.3%	22.4%	2.4%	
All other staff	6.9%	9.2%	18.8%	

Source: Maryland Department of Labor - Survey on Staff Vacancies (2022)

The MD Labor survey found that the average reported correctional officer vacancy at the county

level (14.5%) exceeded DPSCS' rate of around 7 percent. As discussed for DPSCS facilities, county facilities report the most vacancy and turnover for psychologist, social worker, and counselor positions. The lowest vacancy and turnover was reported for all other staff: civilian operations personnel, contact positions, administration, and other ancillary positions. "Other staff" are also the largest share of county correctional employees within five years of retirement.

Current Training, Certification, or Recruitment Processes

Information for Maryland State Correctional Agencies

Correctional officers, similar to sworn police officers, follow a largely paramilitary structure that includes specific training and a regular progression of rank. Hiring, training, and certification processes for DPSCS correctional officers are standardized across the State by the Maryland Police and Correctional Training Commissions (MPCTC). DPSCS correctional officers must complete the Correctional Entry Level Training Program at one of Maryland's regional Academies and be certified by MPCTC to be eligible for CO employment. Selection standards for CO training are listed in detail in the COMAR Title 12, Subtitle 10, Chapter 01 and require that applicants:

- Possess U.S Citizenship or Resident Alien status;
- be at least 21 years of age (or 20 years and six months at time of application); and
- complete background requirements; to include a completed background investigation, fingerprints, physical examination, polygraph examination and a psychological assessment.

Additionally, applicants must have a high school diploma or equivalent.

The hiring process for entry level COs begins when an applicant completes an application for Correctional Officer I (CORR 0003), successfully passes both a three person interview panel and writing sample assessment, and receives a conditional offer of employment from DPSCS. Successful applicants undergo a comprehensive background screening which includes: an interview with an investigator, fingerprinting, employment history, reference checks, education verification, psychological evaluation, physical examination, drug screening, and polygraph.

Successful applicants are assigned to an institution based on the counties where they will accept employment and are then scheduled to attend the Maryland Correctional Entry Level Training Academy in that region. The Academy lasts seven weeks and is fully paid. Trainees enter the academy as Correction Officer I and begin immediately accruing years of service and other State benefits. DPSCS also permits lateral hiring of COs already working in other Maryland jurisdictions or out-of-state. Lateral hires enter as a CO II, but otherwise comply with standards and training established by MPCTC. DPSCS reports 5 lateral CO II hires in CY22.

In addition to the direct entry-level academy pathway, DPSCS also hires some COs and immediately employs them in a trainee capacity within a State correctional facility. Referred to as "blue shirting," this practice allows a CO trainee to gain initial familiarity with their institution while shadowing officers in roles that do not require completion of the academy. Blue shirted

trainees will leave their institution for the academy when space is available and return as a fully certified officer.

Once hired, DPSCS CO staff progress through Correction Officer classifications as outlined in DBM's Salary Plan.⁴ The total salary range for State-employed COs in Maryland stretches from \$43,451 for a new CO I, to \$98,051 for a CO Major (CORR 0009). COs are typically eligible for retirement and pension after 20 years of service.

Information for County and Correctional Local Agencies

County-level correctional officer standards vary slightly across jurisdictions, but largely follow the minimum standards set out by the Maryland Police and Correctional Training Commissions. However, the majority of counties in Maryland have a minimum age of 18 for county COs, compared to a statutorily required minimum age of 21 for DPSCS COs. Most counties also permit applicants to apply before their eighteenth birthday provided they will be 18 at the time of appointment.

County level COs are typically hired and trained on the job by their county facility for a period of time before attending an MPCTC certified academy. The majority of counties report requiring COs to earn MPCTC certification within one year of hire. The minority of county level correctional agencies provide their own in-house MPCTC academy and many participate in regional academies that serve several counties or a geographic region. Examples include the Southern Maryland Criminal Justice Academy, serving departments in Calvert, Charles, and St. Mary's counties, and the Eastern Shore Criminal Justice Academy (ESCJA) operated at Wor-Wic Community College.

SUBSECTION B: POLICE OFFICERS

Staffing Levels & Vacancy

Information for Maryland State Police Agencies

The State of Maryland directly operates five full service police agencies which employ sworn officers: the Maryland Department of State Police (MSP), a department-level executive agency, the Maryland Transportation Authority (MDTA) Police and Maryland Transit Administration (MTA) Police, divisions of the Maryland Department of Transportation (MDOT), Department of Natural Resources (DNR) Police, a division of the Maryland Department of Natural Resources, and the Maryland Capitol Police, a division of the Department of General Services (DGS). Additionally, there are sworn police forces at many University System of Maryland institutions across the state.

In the 2023 fiscal year, the Department of State Police, the largest State police force, was allowed 2,505 total regular positions⁵ 1,569 of which were sworn officers. MSP averaged a

⁴ Salary Plan. (July 18, 2022). Maryland Department of Budget and Management.

⁵ Analysis of the FY 2023 Maryland Executive Budget - W00A Department of State Police. (2022). Department of Legislative Services, Office of Policy Analysis.

vacancy rate of 10.3% for all positions between 2016 and 2021, with civilian vacancy (16.7%) outpacing sworn officer vacancy (7.7%) in 2021. In the beginning of 2022, MSP reported 327 vacant positions, 116 (35.5%) of which have been vacant for over 12 months.

MSP supplied additional staffing data for this report indicating that FY23 actual vacancies among sworn officers have remained consistent with the rate reported for previous years in the FY23 budget analysis. MSP reported 115 vacant officer positions out of 1,569 allowed, for a rate of 7.3 percent. MSP additionally reported 8 separations (voluntary and involuntary) and 17 retirements so far in FY23, with 44 sworn officers being within 5 years of retirement (2.8%).

MDTA Police is nationally accredited and is the eighth largest law enforcement agency in the State of Maryland with more than 500 sworn and civilian professionals. MDTA's police force is responsible for security and law enforcement services at all of MDTA's toll facilities except the northern region of I-95, which is patrolled by the Department of State Police. MDTA is also under contract with the Maryland Aviation Administration to provide law enforcement services at the Baltimore/Washington International Thurgood Marshall Airport (BWI Marshall Airport) and with the Maryland Port Administration (MPA) to provide law enforcement services at MPA-owned facilities at the Port of Baltimore.

In 1971, the Maryland Transit Administration (MTA) Police Force was founded by state legislation, as a fully commissioned, full-service police force, which has full police authority throughout the state of Maryland. The MTA Police Force investigates all state law, and city and county code violations occurring within MTA vehicles, stations, facilities and property. The MTA is unique, as it is the only one of five transit properties in the nation to operate all five modes of transportation: Bus, Metro, Light-Rail, ParaTransit, and Commuter Rail (MARC).

Classification	Average Vacancy Rate
MDTA Police Cadet	57.1%
MDTA Police Officer I	10.0%
MDTA Police Officer II	12.3%
MTA Police Officer	16.3%

Figure 2 - Average Vacancy Rates for MDOT Police Officer Classifications (January - October 2022)

Source: Data supplied by MDOT OHR

Information for County and Local Police Agencies

The US Bureau of Justice Statistics' National Census of State and Local Law Enforcement Agencies⁶ estimates that there are around 12,660 sworn police officers employed by Maryland's county and local police and sheriff's departments. Departments vary widely in size from less than 5 full time officers in rural municipal departments to over 2,000 officers in Baltimore City.

Baltimore City Police Department (BPD), the largest municipal police department in Maryland and the 15th largest overall in the United States, budgeted for 3,260 total employees in FY23 —

⁶ National Census of State and Local Law Enforcement Agencies. (2018). US Bureau of Justice Statistics.

2,605 being sworn officers. Vacancy statistics calculated from BPD's 2022 Staffing Plan Update⁷ are presented in Figure 3. BPD reports a 14.4 percent vacancy among sworn officers and 20.6 percent vacancy rate among civilian and contractor staff for a department wide rate of 15.7 percent.

Sworn Officer Positions						
FY23 Budgeted	Staffed*	Difference	Vacancy Rate			
2,605	2,229	-376	14.4%			
	Civilian/Contractor Positions					
FY23 Budgeted	Staffed*	Difference	Vacancy Rate			
655	520	-135	20.6%			
All Positions						
FY23 Budgeted	Staffed*	Difference	Vacancy Rate			
3,260	2,749	-511	15.7%			
*As of July 28, 2022						

Element 2 EV22	Vacan ary Chatighian fo	n Daltim and City	Dollas Domantes and
FIOII TP = F = F = 2.3	vacancy Statistics to	г вяштоге с пу	Police Department
I Igui C C I I ZC	rucuncy scutistics to	i Dunininoi e City	I once Department

BPD reports that 175-250 officers separate from the department annually, meaning that BPD must train around 230 new officers to overcome attrition. 148 BPD entry level recruits completed the Department's in-house police academy in 2021⁸ and a total of 184 trainee hires were reported. Based on this figure, BPD met 80 percent of its training goal for CY2021 through in house training, which includes a recently established Registered Cadet Apprenticeship Program.

The Maryland Apprenticeship in Public Safety Workgroup had limited participation from county and local police departments and while a personnel survey was issued to participating departments, the workgroup does not have comprehensive vacancy statistics for this interim report. Increasing the number of local police departments and law enforcement employee groups in the Workgroup remains a top priority for future sessions.

Current Training, Certification, or Recruitment Processes

Information for Maryland State Police Agencies

Hiring and training for Maryland State Police Officers (Troopers) is the most rigorous and regimented process among Maryland's law enforcement agencies. To be considered for the process, applicants must:

- be a United States citizen;
- be at least 20 years of age, but not older than 59;
- possess a valid high school diploma or its equivalent;
- possess a valid Driver's License in any state, and have a satisfactory driving record;
- be eligible to obtain a Maryland Driver's License;

² 2022 Staffing Plan Update. (August 2022). Baltimore Police Department.

⁸ 2022 Master Training Plan. (March 21, 2022). Baltimore Police Department, Education and Training Section.

- have binocular far and near visual acuity, with or without correction;
- meet the MSP standards of medical fitness;
- have a good reputation and sound moral character; and
- not have any current court orders relating to domestic violence.

A multistage interview and screening process follows application and consists of examinations and panel interviews similar to those required by DPSCS for State correctional officers. The entire application process can take as long as six months to complete. Qualified applicants are hired as MSP Trooper Candidates and required to attend the Academy.

Trooper Candidates attend the Academy for 26 weeks and live on site for five days a week during the program. The Academy consists of vehicle operations, firearms training, defensive tactics training, certifications, and 45 credits of college-level coursework. Following graduation, Candidates report to their assigned barrack and are supervised on the job for an additional 8 weeks.

Beyond the sworn Trooper pathway, MSP also operates the Aviation Command, which relies on highly skilled and specially trained staff to operate and support the Department's fleet of aircraft. Flight Paramedics or Trooper Medics are sworn Troopers who are dually certified as paramedics and work aboard MSP aircraft.

Applicants must be 21 years old by the time of their graduation from the MSP Trooper Academy, but may enter at 20 years and six months. Younger candidates may join the Department as State Police Cadets. Cadets must be 18 years old at the time of appointment, and serve in unclassified positions without police authority. Cadets are typically assigned to the Commercial Vehicle Enforcement Division and work under the supervision of a Trooper until they reach 21 and can enter the Academy. Cadets are paid and earn years of service to count towards retirement and pension.

According to the State Salary Plan, MSP salaries range from \$32,873 for a cadet to \$169,003 for an MSP Captain-5900. Many MSP Troopers are eligible to claim retirement and pension benefits after 22 years of state service, though the service requirement has most recently been set to 25.

Officers of the MDTA and MTA Police are subject to hiring, interview, and training standards similar to those of MSP, with some slight differences in the academy training component. Additionally, MTA Police have adopted a walk-in one-day process for initial screening. The process permits applicants to walk in, take a qualification examination, agility test, and background examination on site, and potentially earn an expedited entry into the Administration's Academy.

Information for County and Local Police Agencies

Recruitment and training for county and local police and sheriff's departments closely mirrors that of State Agencies and is based around standards set by MPCTC. Many counties and large departments, such as Baltimore City, typically offer their own police academies in-house and provide training to their entry level recruits, lateral hires, and in service officers. New recruits

must be 21 years old to enter a police academy in Maryland. Length of academy training for new recruits across the state ranges from 26-30 weeks and generally includes a post-graduation on-patrol supervision period of around 8 weeks. Many counties or departments that staff their own police academy will also enroll trainees from neighboring counties and jurisdictions. Similar to corrections, some regional academies serve multiple counties and departments.

Most counties and localities in Maryland report offering unclassified cadet positions. Similar to MSP's Trooper Cadet Program, police cadets are recruits aged between 17 and 20, who are serving in non-police law enforcement capacities before they are eligible to enter an academy at 21. In Baltimore City, cadets are often assigned to postings in agency units such as Pawn Shop, Aviation, Crime Lab, Homicide, Public Integrity, Special Enforcement, and Patrol Districts. BPD cadets also have the opportunity to enroll in two courses per semester at Baltimore City Community College, at no cost to the cadet. Police academies across Maryland generally involve enrollment in college-level coursework through a community college and may lead to an associate's degree. BPD has sponsored a Registered Apprenticeship program for cadets since MATC approved their program in July 2018.

SUBSECTION C: COMMUNITY SUPERVISION

Community supervision is another critical function of Maryland's public safety system. The DPSCS Maryland Parole Commision (MPC) and Division of Parole and Probation (DPP) provide the State's community supervision services. DPSCS operates 36 Parole and Probation offices across Maryland and supervised 77,117 cases in FY21.⁹ DPP staff provide services for probationers assigned by Maryland's courts, parolees discharged from correctional institutions, and administer the Drinking Driver Monitor Program (DDMP).

Staffing Levels & Vacancy

For FY23, the Department of Legislative Services reported that community supervision agencies (MPC and DPP) were allowed 1,178 regular positions. 925 of which were DPP agents and DDMP monitors. At the close of CY21, 212 community supervision positions were vacant (17.9%). Several factors including the pandemic and a previous State hiring freeze impacted DPSCS' ability to refill open positions and train agents and monitors, but the Department continues to see some staffing improvement.

According to DPSCS' July 2022 Hiring and Attrition Report, net recruitment for community supervision staff modestly improved in the first quarter of CY22 but dipped slightly in the second quarter. In Q1, DPSCS hired an average of 11 community supervision staff per month and lost 5, for a net gain of about 6 staff per month. In Q2, community supervision saw a net monthly loss of 1.3 staff members.

Current Training, Certification, or Recruitment Processes

The majority of community supervision staff entering the field will be hired on as Parole and

⁹ Analysis of the FY 2023 Maryland Executive Budget - Q00C - DPSCS Community Supervision. (2022). Department of Legislative Services, Office of Policy Analysis.

Probation Agent I. This classification is one of the only entry level public safety occupations to require a bachelor's degree as a minimum qualification. Applicants must be 21 years old and possess a college degree with at least 30 semester credits in social, behavioral, or correctional sciences. Applicants may substitute one year of specialized experience counseling, investigating or supervising persons on parole or probation for the 30 credit hours of required coursework.

Agents who meet the baseline requirements for the position and pass all other portions of the screening are required to attend a ten-week Entry Level Training Program conducted by MPCTC in Sykesville, Maryland. Upon completion of the Academy, Agents are assigned to one of Maryland DPP field offices in the jurisdiction where the applicant indicated that they would accept employment.

Drinking Driver Monitors are another large class of community supervision staff employed by DPP. Entry level Drinking Driver Monitor I candidates must also be 21 at the time of appointment and meet standards established by MPCTC. However, DDMP Monitor I positions do not require a bachelor's degree, the minimum education required is a high school diploma or equivalent.

Community supervision staff salaries range from \$37,937 for a new Drinking Driver Monitor I to \$114,441 for a senior Regional Parole and Probation Administrator. Community supervision staff are generally eligible for retirement and pension benefits after 20 years of State service. The DDMP series are not eligible for 20 year retirement.

SECTION V: APPRENTICESHIP IN PUBLIC SAFETY – CASE STUDIES

CASE STUDY A: BALTIMORE COUNTY POLICE DEPARTMENT - OFFICER APPRENTICESHIP

Several law enforcement agencies across Maryland are or have been Registered Apprenticeship sponsors for public safety professions. The size, longevity, and participation rates for public safety Registered Apprenticeships have varied, but longitudinal data do exist for at least one active program, the Officer Apprenticeship Program sponsored by Baltimore County Police Department.

The Baltimore County program was registered in 1987 and enrolls apprentice officers who are otherwise eligible to enter the County's Police Academy (aged 21 and above). The apprenticeship lasts two years and encompasses 2,000 hours of OJL supervised one-on-one by a mentor officer. RI is provided in house by the Baltimore County Police Academy.

Since 1987, the program has registered 2,642 apprentices, 18 percent of which were female and 21 percent of which were non-white. 2,140 apprentices (81%) completed their Registered

Apprenticeship and were eligible to become sworn officers. As of September 2022, 251 active apprentices were registered with Baltimore County. Notably, the program has reported strong and even improving results for non-white and female officer apprentices, groups that have broadly had lower representation in policing. Seventy-six percent of all female officer apprentices and 67 percent of all non-white apprentices who registered completed the program, and in cohorts registered in the last 5 years, an average of 33 percent of apprentices have been non-white.

	All Apprentices	Female	Female % of Total	Non-white	Non-white % of Total
Registered	2,642	481	18%	567	21%
Completed	2,140	373	17%	389	18%
Currently Active	251	59	24%	90	36%

Figure 4 - Total Registrations and Demographic Data for Baltimore County Police
Registered Apprenticeship Program (1987-2022)

MD Labor and Baltimore County Police reviewed all completed Registered Apprentices going back to 1987 and conducted a simple census of completed apprentices who were still employed with the Department in October 2022. Results of the review are reported in Figure 6 on page 26.

The review found that 1,231 of the 2,140 officer apprentices who completed the program since 1987 are still employed with Baltimore County in 2022 (57.5%). This figure is based on a single point-in-time review of officers who completed the Department's Registered Apprenticeship Program and are still on payroll as of October 2022. The review and the data reported in this case study are not inclusive of full career officer retirements, lateral hires to other departments, or officers killed in the line of duty. By not accounting for retirements and officers who left the department, but may remain in law enforcement, the overall retention rate may potentially exceed the one calculated for this case study.

In Figure 6, completer cohorts from 1987 to 1998 are shaded in gray to indicate that officer apprentice completers from this period are likely already retired or near retirement based on Baltimore County's 25-year pension plan. As a result, retention rates calculated for these years and their 4-year cohorts may not accurately reflect actual retention. However, 8.83 percent of officer apprentices that entered the program between 1987 and 1990, and completed, remain with the Department in 2022. The average Baltimore County Police Officer Apprentice will go on to serve the Department for 16.9 years.

The median retention rate for the program was calculated for apprentice cohorts that were the least likely to be retired at the time of the review – completers registered since 1999. This median retention rate is 74.8 percent. Retention rates crested at an average range of 82.5-83.3 percent between 2003 and 2012, and have leveled off around 74 percent per cohort since 2013.

Taken in the context of the available national statistics on police officer training and retention, Baltimore County's Registered Officer Apprenticeship appears to meet or exceed the performance of police training programs across the US. According to the most recently available comprehensive data provided by the US Bureau of Justice Statistics (2018),¹⁰ approximately 86 percent of new recruit officers complete academy training. For Baltimore County's 2018 cohort, 77.8 percent completed the program and the academy. Overall, apprentices completed at a rate of 81 percent since 1987, just slightly below the BJS 2018 rate.

Where Registered Apprenticeship appears to offer an advantage is in officer retention. The Bureau of Justice Statistics reported in 2008¹¹ that local police departments and sherrifs' offices are deeply affected by non-retirement separation (resignations). For local police about 55 percent of separations in an average year are resignations and the average turnover and churn rate is around 80 percent. Even in the absence of more recent national data, Baltimore County's median apprentice retention rate of 75 percent and average officer service life of almost 17 years is an accomplishment that suggests Registered Apprenticeship might be a strong model for boosting retention through local police training.

CASE STUDY B: STATE OF CALIFORNIA CORRECTIONAL PEACE OFFICER APPRENTICESHIP

With over 90,000 apprentices, California has the largest Registered Apprenticeship Program in the United States by total enrollment. Apprenticeships in California are registered by the USDOL-approved California Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS), a state body largely equivalent to Maryland's Apprenticeship and Training Program (MATP).

A rather unique aspect of California's approach to Registered Apprenticeship is the degree to which some public agencies are *required* to use apprenticeship as a training model for their staff. One such example is the California Commission on Correctional Peace Officer Standards and Training (CPOST). CPOST is California's State authority on training standards for correctional peace officers and is analogous to the Maryland Police and Correctional Training Commissions (MPCTC). Much as MPCTC is a division of the Department of Public Safety and Correctional Services, CPOST is a division of the California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation.

CPOST was established in 1995 by California Penal Code, Sections 13600 through 13603 as the statutory entity for training and certifying correctional peace officers. Through additions to the establishing statute, CPOST was eventually mandated to leverage apprenticeship as a training model for officers:

California Code, Penal Code - $PEN \S 13601(a)(1)$: The CPOST shall develop, approve, and monitor standards for the selection and training of state correctional peace officer apprentices.

CPOST administers a state-wide apprenticeship program for entry-level correctional peace officers and related occupations and works with DAS and the California Division of Industrial Relations (DIR) to register apprentices and issue national credentials consistent with Registered

¹⁰ <u>State and Local Law Enforcement Training Academies, 2018 - Statistical Tables. 2018. US Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, Bureau of Justice Statistics.</u>

¹¹ Hiring and Retention of State and Local Law Enforcement Officers, 2008 - Statistical Tables, 2008. US Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, Bureau of Justice Statistics.

Apprenticeship. The CPOST program is administered at the highest level by an executive board consisting of six voting members representing the Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation, collective bargaining units, and employee associations. Three of the executive board seats are appointed by the governor. CPOST also staffs a full time Apprenticeship Coordinator's Office (ACO), which oversees the management of the apprenticeship program, registration of apprentices with DAS, and the coordination of Local Apprenticeship Sub-committees (LAS).¹²

At the institutional level, each correctional institution in California establishes a Local Apprenticeship Sub-committee which oversees the local correctional apprentices and training procedures. Each LAS is responsible for reviewing and maintaining its institution's apprenticeship standards, managing and appointing journeyworker trainers, verifying the progress of apprentices through their OJL, and forwarding all documentation and registrations up to ACO. The LAS consists of a correctional lieutenant or field training sergeant from the local institution and an appointee from the local chapter of the Correctional Peace Officers Association.

There are a total of nine occupations apprenticeable under the CPOST program:

- Correctional Officer
- Correctional Counselor I
- Parole Agent I
- Parole Agent Department of Juvenile Justice (DJJ) (Institution)
- Medical Technical Assistant
- DJJ Caseworker Specialist
- Youth Correctional Counselor
- Youth Correctional Officer
- Correctional Firefighter

CPOST apprentices must be 21 years old to enter the program and are required to complete 24 months of on the job training totaling 3,600 work process hours. In addition, apprentices must complete 288 hours of related instruction offered as a combination of academy-based training provided by CPOST and/or classroom-based training offered through a community college. Specialized RI is required for occupations that require additional knowledge and skills. Apprentices are mentored on a three to one apprentice to journeyworker ratio and apprentices with previous work experience or educational history relevant to the profession can have their total required months in the program reduced.

CASE STUDY C: CONSTABLE DEGREE-APPRENTICESHIP IN THE UNITED KINGDOM

¹² Apprenticeship Program Operational Procedures. 2022. The California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation and Department of Youth and Community Restoration, Apprenticeship Program.

In the United States, apprenticeship accounts for around 0.2 percent of the nation's workforce, while in the United Kingdom the share of apprentices is around 2.7 percent.¹³ Apprenticeship in the United Kingdom is more widely adopted by various types of industries and occupations compared to the US and the public sector, in particular, has government-issued mandates to employ apprentices. Public sector bodies in the United Kingdom with more than 250 employees have a goal of employing a staff of at least 2.3 percent apprentices. As of the 2021-2022 academic year, the UK's public sector apprenticeship average was around 1.7 percent with the largest sector being the armed forces.¹⁴

Additionally, many apprenticeships in the UK, particularly in England, have been structured as degree apprenticeships which offer apprentices the opportunity to earn a bachelor's or master's degree as a result of related instruction. Thirteen point one percent of all apprentices starting during the 21-22 academic year in the UK were starting a degree apprenticeship. Degree apprenticeships arrange for all or the majority of the cost of an apprentice's tuition and fees be covered by the employer, allowing the apprentice to develop vocational skills and earn a nearly free degree simultaneously.

The public safety sector in the United Kingdom makes up the minority of public sector apprenticeships, but the workgroup did review a police constable degree apprenticeship program offered by Leicestershire Police, in Leicestershire County, England.¹⁵ Leicestershire's program allows apprentices to apply at age 17 and fully enroll on their 18th birthday. Applicants must hold a *level 2* qualification (roughly equivalent to a US high school diploma)¹⁶ at entry and will earn their *level 3* in the first year of the program (qualification for entry to a university) as well as a driver's license if they do not already possess one.

Constable apprentices work on the job under the supervision of a senior officer and simultaneously attend criminal justice courses at an affiliated university. After three years, apprentices become fully sworn officers and are awarded a *level 6* credential (bachelor's degree equivalent) enabling them to pursue specialized positions such as detective, cyber crimes investigator, or progression through the department's rank system. Apprentices are paid £19,164 in their first year, £24,780 in the second, £25,902 in the third and £41,130 as full officers. Additionally, apprentices are immediately enrolled in the National Police Pension Scheme and the department contributes 21.3 percent of the apprentice's earnings to their pension plan.

While the United Kingdom's apprenticeship system is considerably more developed and offers a promising model for reaching youth apprentices and providing broader pathways to higher education that reduce educational costs and debt, there are key systematic differences and limitations that must be examined in comparison to the US system.

Apprenticeship Levy

In April 2017, the United Kingdom implemented a national Apprenticeship Levy. All UK companies with a total *pay bill* (payroll) over £3 million are required to pay a levy of 0.5 percent on their total

¹³ Apprenticeships and Labor Market Information: What Works. Monica Herk. Committee for Economic Development

¹⁴ Apprenticeships and Traineeships. September 2022. United Kingdom Statistics Authority.

¹⁵ <u>Police Constable Degree Apprenticeship (PCDA). 2022. Leicestershire Police.</u>

¹⁶ Apprenticeships, 14 to 19 education and training for work. 2022. UK Government.

payroll.¹⁷ The revenue generated from the levy is put into accounts that employers can access to cover the cost of training apprentices. Allowable expenses include related instruction, tuition and fees, and the cost of assessment services. Employers who pay into the levy receive their contribution, multiplied by a proportion of the employees they employ in England, plus a 10 percent contribution from the UK Government. Employers who are too small to pay into the levy can access funds if they cover 5 percent of their apprentices' costs up front, with the Government covering the remaining costs.

While the United States does provide various opportunities for financial support to employers sponsoring Registered Apprenticeship, there is no comparable funding to that provided by the Apprenticeship Levy. In the 21-22 academic year alone, 62.5 percent of new apprentices in England were funded by Apprenticeship Service Account (ASA) levy funds.¹⁸ Varying data on the topic exists, but research seems to suggest that the levy has had a considerable impact on allowing employers to participate in apprenticeship and in particular degree apprenticeships. Comparatively, higher education is both longer and more expensive in the US than in the UK. The combination of higher costs, longer programs, and the absence of a widely implemented progressive system for employer assistance means that it may be more difficult to implement degree apprenticeship without considerable further investment.

Educational Structure

One additional consideration specific to a contrast between the United Kingdom and United States lies in the structure of the education systems. In the United Kingdom, compulsory school attendance effectively ends at age 16 for students that wish to enroll in occupational or technical education. In England, a student may leave school on the last Friday in June if they will turn 16 before the end of the summer, provided that they stay involved in either college or apprenticeship until age 18.¹⁹ In the UK system, students typically will earn a General Certificate of Secondary Education (GCSE) (roughly equivalent to a US high school diploma) between age 14 and 16, enabling them to leave school at 16 and pursue apprenticeship if they desire. Approximately a quarter of new apprentices in England each year are under 19 years old at the time that they start their apprenticeship, indicating a strong pipeline of students choosing occupational education.

In the United States, students generally do not graduate from high school until age 18 and most apprenticeship programs require a high school diploma or its equivalent. In most states, a student cannot earn a high school diploma outside of regular high school enrollment before age 18 without specific exception granted by the student's school district. In Maryland, compulsory attendance law additionally requires that all students remain enrolled in school until age 18. In the absence of an alternative educational progression pathway before age 18, Registered Apprenticeship in the US is dependent on being integrated with the public school system to reach youth apprentices. The US system may be undeserving students who could benefit from occupation-based education but are not participating in high school due to other barriers.

¹⁷ HMRC Apprenticeship Levy Manual. August 2022. HM Revenue & Customs.

¹⁸ Apprenticeships and Traineeships. September 2022. United Kingdom Statistics Authority.

¹⁹ School Leaving Age. 2022. UK Government.

SECTION VI: POTENTIAL MODELS FOR PUBLIC SAFETY APPRENTICESHIP IN MARYLAND

MODEL A: EXPAND EMPLOYER SPONSORED REGISTERED APPRENTICESHIP

The first approach to furthering public safety apprenticeships in Maryland is to continue to grow the existing model, employer sponsored Registered Apprenticeships. In this model, the apprentice's employer is also the sponsor who creates, seeks approval for, and manages the Registered Apprenticeship program. All of the previous and current law enforcement apprenticeships registered in Maryland are employer sponsored programs, including the Baltimore County Officer Apprenticeship Program profiled in Case Study A.

Under this model, an individual police department, sheriff's office, correctional institution, or State agency would devise their own standards in consultation with any relevant collective bargaining units, and seek approval from MATC. Once approved, the department would recruit and train its own apprentices for employment within the department and oversee and administer its own program. Related instruction could be provided from within the department, if the department or jurisdiction offers an approved training, or it could be contracted to another entity or academy outside of the jurisdiction.

The most notable advantage of this model is the ease of its implementation. Each department can independently assess which occupations to apprentice, how it will compensate and train apprentices, and can formulate its own standards in accordance with any collective bargaining agreements. With fewer organizations involved, this process can be done relatively quickly with technical assistance from MATP.

This model is particularly advantageous for large departments or county-level departments such as sheriffs' offices. Large departments will potentially have multiple apprenticeable occupations, a pre-existing academy or training scheme, and a more established HR and personnel system that can absorb the administrative requirements associated with registering apprentices. Operating the entire program within one department or one county system means continuity of payroll for apprentices and accrued service time for retirement and pension benefits. Additionally, large departments can take advantage of cadet programs and corrections positions, which often employ trainees as young as 18, to provide pathways for youth apprentices. A county sponsored program could also potentially integrate easily with the county's school system and AMP.

Despite these benefits, the employer-sponsored model may still disadvantage small, municipal, and rural departments. While there are several programs and funding opportunities to support Registered Apprenticeships, the programs are not completely without costs to sponsors. There is direct financial cost of apprentice wages, training expenses, and additional indirect costs for mentor staff time, administrative capacity, program oversight, and reporting. Retention outcomes and better organized training practices may outweigh these in the long term, but in the short term

small and under-resourced departments may struggle to establish and sustain a program without outside support or additional funding. Several of the employer sponsored law enforcement programs currently or previously registered in Maryland have been canceled or have experienced long and sustained periods of inactivity due to similar resource challenges.

MODEL B: CREATE LOCAL OR REGIONAL JOINT APPRENTICESHIP & TRAINING COMMITTEES

One approach to sponsorship that potentially mitigates some of the shortcomings of employer sponsored programs is the formation of a Joint Apprenticeship Training Committee (JATC). JATCs are a type of intermediary non-employer sponsorship commonly used in the building trades. Some of the longest running and most successful Registered Apprenticeship programs in the country are JATCs.

JATCs are based around a central committee which is generally formed from multiple employers, labor unions, training providers, and associations representing employees in the apprentice occupations. The JATC itself, not the employer, is the sponsor and is responsible for maintaining the program's standards, registering apprentices, and managing the apprenticeship program. Employers pay the apprentices that they employ, but the entire experience is mediated and administered by the JATC in conjunction with MD Labor and MATC.

JATCs pool together resources from employers, labor unions, and state grants to establish "Apprenticeship Training Funds." These Funds are managed by the JATC and help establish training systems and administrative supports that sustain the apprenticeship long term. As independent bodies, JATCs also allow management and organized labor to work together to define standards that align with collective bargaining agreements and any established policies and regulations. In the building trades, JATCs often establish their own training centers which provide related instruction consistent with the JATCs specific standards. In law enforcement, a JATC could center around an existing police or correctional academy and would have to adopt standards based on those set by MPCTC. The end goal of a JATC is a well supported pipeline of consistently trained apprentices ready to serve multiple employers.

JATCs are uncommon in law enforcement apprenticeships, but they present a strong model for counties and departments that may lack sufficient resources to operate a Registered Apprenticeship on their own. For example, some of the state's smallest departments are located on Maryland's Eastern Shore. More than 60 law enforcement agencies on the Shore utilize the MPCTC-approved Eastern Shore Criminal Justice Academy (ESCJA) hosted at Wor-Wic Community College. A JATC could be established consisting of ESCJA, representatives from any participating Eastern Shore police, sheriffs', or correctional departments, associated labor unions, local high schools, and any law enforcement employee associations.

A regional JATC would develop apprenticeship standards for all occupations in the participating departments across the region – cadets, police, corrections, etc. – establishing one unified program centered around the departments' shared training academy and regional workforce needs. Each department and member agency would contribute some resources to the JATC and the JATC would build a full time staff devoted to recruiting, registering, managing, and

overseeing the law enforcement apprentices. The JATC would fairly match apprentices with training and employment opportunities across all of the member departments.

As a new concept for law enforcement training, JATCs would likely have a longer implementation timeline than the employer sponsored model discussed in the previous section. Once established, however, the model is easily adaptable to many regions across Maryland and it potentially has major strengths for growing integration with local high schools for youth apprenticeship and regional higher education centers for degree apprenticeship. Built out to their fullest extent, regional JATCs could additionally incorporate DPSCS' community supervision offices, establishing a degree apprenticeship pathway program that connects highly trained apprentices to the State's regional Parole and Probation offices.

MODEL C: ESTABLISH A STATEWIDE APPRENTICESHIP COMMISSION

Assuming Maryland continues down a path of expanded Registered Apprenticeship in public safety, a preferable model may be the establishment of a statewide law enforcement apprenticeship commission. Informed by the California Commission on Correctional Peace Officer Standards and Training (CPOST) Apprenticeship Program profiled in Case Study C, a statewide commission would position a State of Maryland agency to serve as an independent sponsor of law enforcement Registered Apprenticeship across multiple facilities and departments.

In California's system the State Department of Corrections has a division (CPOST) responsible for correctional peace officer training and standards. That division was mandated by legislation to facilitate training through apprenticeship. CPOST and its constituent parts, the Executive Board and Office of the Apprenticeship Coordinator (AOC), serve as the Registered Apprenticeship sponsor for all correctional peace officer occupations across the entire state. They leverage locally based committees – a potential integration of the JATC model presented in the previous section – to coordinate apprentices on the group at local institutions. The AOC, a full time staff office, aggregates all apprentice data from the local committees and reports registrations and apprentice progress data back to DAS and DIR (the California equivalent of MATP and MD Labor).

Deploying a similar system in Maryland would likely begin with Maryland Police and Correctional Training Commissions (MPCTC) adopting apprenticeship as an integrated training model. To mimic CPOST, MPCTC would have to establish an executive board(s) and coordination office(s) for apprenticeship, potentially one each for police and correctional occupations. The established board(s) would then work with their relevant collective bargaining units to create apprenticeship standards and seek registration from MATC.



Figure 5 - Example of a Statewide Commission Structure Under MPCTC and DPSCS

Developing a statewide commission on apprenticeship in public safety would be a considerable undertaking likely necessitating legislative reform, changes to regulation, and even the creation of new state agencies and boards, however, should Maryland see a rise in local Registered Apprenticeship programs or JATC-style sponsors in law enforcement, a statewide commission may be a logical and worthwhile expansion of the system.

Having a fulltime statewide commission working in concert with local committees would mean significantly better information on the state of Maryland's law enforcement workforce. The commission would be able to make informed strategic training decisions which direct funds and resources to departments across the state based on staffing plans and anticipated workforce changes. The commission's coordination office(s) could work in conjunction with MD Labor and MSDE to establish and maintain law enforcement apprenticeship programs in every county school district, and build connections with institutions of higher education to develop degree apprenticeship pathways that move motivated apprentices upwards towards high-demand high-skill occupations such as Parole and Probation Agents, trooper medics, and special investigative units.

SECTION VII: WORKGROUP OUTLOOK

This report highlights the many ways in which Maryland's law enforcement and public safety systems have been challenged by workforce issues. Aside from the impacts of COVID-19 and national upticks in retirement, resignation, and turnover, law enforcement remains a profession that uniquely requires significant sacrifice, personal risk, and integrity. Over the long history of Maryland's programs, Registered Apprentices have been killed in the line of duty while serving

the departments which employed and trained them. This Workgroup acknowledges their service and recognizes that improving public safety training means continually working to support and protect those who chose to serve their community through careers in public safety.

This workgroup made significant progress in assessing the disparate variation that exists across the public safety system and formulating recommendations for how Registered Apprenticeship might be used to structure and standardize disparate training processes and priorities. In addition to the findings and information put forth in this report, the workgroup has identified additional priorities that will be addressed moving forward into 2023:

- DWDAL will work to roll out funding programs that support recommendations put forth in this report;
- this Workgroup will pursue broader participation from a greater number of local and county police and sheriffs' departments; and
- this Workgroup will pursue broader participation from a greater number of labor organizations representing public safety agencies across Maryland.

The Maryland Apprenticeship in Public Safety Workgroup convened for its last 2022 session on November 7, 2022 to finalize edits and comments to this report. Following a recess for the remainder of 2022, the Workgroup will reconvene in 2023. A 2023 meeting schedule has not yet been finalized and members are discussing potential agenda items for future sessions. If MD Labor begins to work directly with public safety agencies to plan and establish new Registered Apprenticeship programs or funding initiatives to support new programs, it is likely that this Workgroup will split into small subgroups focused on more specific priorities. An update on all 2023 Workgroup progress will be submitted to the Chairmen in a final report by June 30, 2023.

Year of Registration	Completed Officer Apprentices	No Longer Employed with the Department	Still Employed with the Department	Retention Rate	4-Year Cohort Retention Rate
1987	67	64	3	4.48%	
1988	129	117	12	9.30%	8.83%
1989	61	55	6	9.84%	8.83%
1990	60	53	7	11.67%	
1991	34	31	3	8.82%	
1992	29	23	6	20.69%	2(220/
1993	24	15	9	37.50%	26.22%
1994	138	97	41	29.71%	
1995	100	48	52	52.00%	
1996	87	44	43	49.43%	5(250/
1997	102	45	57	55.88%	56.25%
1998	79	24	55	69.62%	
1999	84	24	60	71.43%	
2000	89	33	56	62.92%	(= 200/
2001	74	22	52	70.27%	67.38%
2002	78	27	51	65.38%	
2003	94	31	63	67.02%	
2004	73	10	63	86.30%	02 200/
2005	77	6	71	92.21%	83.39%
2006	75	6	69	92.00%	
2007	105	22	83	79.05%	
2009	1	1		0.00%	07 5/0/
2011	36	4	32	88.89%	82.56%
2012	30	3	27	90.00%	
2013	143	36	107	74.83%	
2017	84	20	64	76.19%	74.060/
2018	109	31	78	71.56%	74.06%
2019	38	10	28	73.68%	
2020	40	7	33	82.50%	
Grand Total	2140	909	1231	57.52%	

Figure 6 - Officer Apprentice Retention Review: Baltimore County Police Department Registered Apprenticeship Program Completers (1987 - 2022)

Median Retention Rate (completers since 1999)

74.83%

	Sponsor(s)	Ease of Implementation	Advantage	Disadvantage	Youth Involvement	Degree Apprenticeship
Employer Sponsored Program	Individual departments; local police departments, county police and sherrifs' offices,	Easiest; several months to one year	Ideal for large departments and county-wide departments with multiple	Significant administrative responsibilities for the sponsor	Dependant on a department's apprenticeable occupations	Dependant on the department's apprenticeable occupations
	county corrections, individual state agencies		occupations and well developed personnel offices/training resources	Departments solely cover costs associated with training	Police departments may not be able to engage youth without a cadet program	Dependant on the department's budget and training resources
			Simplifies payroll and benefits	May be difficult to sustain for small departments	More difficult for small departments	May be difficult for small or rural departments
Law Enforcement Joint Training Committee (JATC)	Joint committee of multiple employers, training providers, organized labor	Medium; several months to over one year	Allows small departments and rural regions to pool resources Lateral and vertical progress across occupations	May require establishment of a new organization Multiple payroll, pension, and benefit schemes	Allows for creative programs that accommodate age restrictions Integration with multiple local school districts	Creates shared resources to support education costs Leverages regional institutions to train and retain local apprentices
Statewide Commission	A State agency such as MPCTC, statewide organized labor, or a statewide employee association	Most complex; likely multiple years	Creates the largest pool of resources, standardizes training Benefits multiple occupations and geographies	Significant regulatory or statutory change needed, complex implementation	Can support the creation of youth programs statewide Clear and comprehensive career pathways	Allows partnerships with institutions across the state Best option for integrating four year degree programs

Figure 7 - Comparison of Models for Public Safety Apprenticeship in Maryland from Section VI